Impact of Preferential Flow on Radionuclide Distribution in Soil

MAYA BUNDT,† ACHIM ALBRECHT, Pascal FROI Devaux, PETER BLASER, AND HANNES FLUHLER
Swiss Federal Institute of Forest, Snow and Landscape Research, Zürcherstr 111 8903 Birmensdorf, Switzerland, Institute of Plant Sciences Eschikon Experimental Station, P.O. Box 185 8315 Lindau, Switzerland, Institut de Radiophysique appliquée Centre universitaire, Grand Pré 1 1007 Lausanne Switzerland, and Institute of Terrestrial Ecology, Grabenstr 11a 8952 Schlieren, Switzerland

Migration of radionuclides in soils and their transfer to edible plants are usually estimated using volume-averaged bulk concentrations. However, radionuclides might not be homogeneously distributed in soils due to heterogeneous water flow and solute transport. One important cause of heterogeneous transport is preferential flow. The aim of this study was to investigate the spatial distribution of radionuclides in the soil in relation to preferential flow paths and to assess the possible consequences for their transfer from soil to plants. We identified the preferential flow paths in a forest soil by staining them with a blue dye and compared radionuclide activity in samples from the stained preferential flow paths with those from the unstained soil matrix. The activities of the atmospherically deposited radionuclides 137Cs, 210Pb, 239,240Pu, 238Pu, and 241Am were enriched in the preferential flow paths by a factor of up to 3.5. Despite their different depositional histories, the distribution of the radionuclides between preferential flow paths and matrix was similar. Our findings indicate increased transport of radionuclides through the preferential flow paths, representing a possible risk of groundwater contamination. Furthermore, enrichment of radionuclides in the preferential flow paths might influence the uptake by plants. The heterogeneous radionuclide distribution in the soil and the more intense rooting in the preferential flow paths can be incorporated into soil-to-plant transfer models. Taking the correlated radionuclide and root distribution between the two flow regions into account provides a more physical and biological basis for the calculation of plant activities with transfer models than using the homogeneously mixed bulk soil activities as input parameters.

Introduction

Migration of elements such as radionuclides and their transfer from soil to plants is estimated with bulk soil activities. Although it is known that water flow and solute transport in soils is often heterogeneous (1–5). Such heterogeneities, one of them being preferential flow, are the rule rather than the exception (6). Preferential flows of the rapid transport of water and solutes, bypassing a large part of the soil matrix and therefore affecting only a small portion of the whole soil volume. Short-term laboratory and field experiments showed that preferential flow plays an important role in the transport of highly sorbing solutes such as pesticides (7). However, to our knowledge, no long-term field experiments exist that assess the impact of preferential flow on the spatial distribution of sorbing substances. It affects the leaching process of such substances toward the groundwater as well as their accessibility by plant roots.

To analyze the long-term impact of preferential flow on the distribution of different tracers, we take advantage of the fallout of radionuclides with different depositional histories: the single-pulse deposition of 137Cs in 1966, the continuous deposition of 210Pb and the step-input deposition of 239,240Pu, 238Pu, and 241Am in the 1950s and 1960s. The aim of this study was to investigate the spatial distribution of these radionuclides in a soil profile in relation to preferential flow paths and to assess the consequences for the transfer from soil to plants.

Experimental Methods

The study presented here was conducted on four plots of 3 m by 7 m situated on the corners of a well-characterized site of approximately 2 ha in Central Northern Switzerland from April 1998 to May 1999. The site was planted in 1930 with Norway spruce (Picea abies L. Karst) as the dominant tree species mixed with beech (Fagus sylvatica L.) and some other species. The soil is an acid brown forest soil (Dystric Cambisol (8)). Selected chemical and physical properties are given in Table 1.

To determine the total atmospheric deposition of radionuclides, we took samples (blocks with the following dimensions: 14 cm width, 25 cm length, and 10 or 20 cm depth, see Table 2) to a depth of 0.6 m at one of the four plots.

To stain the preferential flow paths in the soil, we applied a dye solution (deionized water containing 5 g L−1 Brilliant Blue FCF (C142090)) in 6 h with a portable sprinkling device (6,9) at a constant rate that did not cause ponding. This corresponds approximately to a heavy thunderstorm shower. One day after dye application, we opened a trench to 1.2 m depth. A vertical soil profile of 1 m by 1 m was prepared within the irrigated plot, 30 cm away from the plots’ border, and photographed. These photos (n = 100) were then used to quantify the proportion of the profile area stained with Brilliant Blue. This dye coverage is a measure for the volumetric proportion of preferential flow paths. In delineated depths of 0–9, 9–20, 20–50, and 50–100 cm, samples were taken with a small spatula from the stained regions, representing preferential flow paths, and from the unstained soil matrix. On each of the four plots, we sampled five profiles with a separation distance of 10 cm. To determine the root biomass, we used three small cores per depth and flow region (e.g., preferential flow path and matrix) with a volume of 9.07 cm³ each. The cores were pushed carefully by hand into the soil perpendicular to the exposed face. We repeated the same experimental protocol five times (04/98, 06/98, 10/98, 04/99, 05/99). After the soil had been oven dried and sieved to 2 cm, 137Cs and 210Pb were measured using γ-spectroscopy, and 239,240Pu, 238Pu, and 241Am the latter being a decay product of 241Pu, were measured using α-spectroscopy (10). Since preparation prior to analysis of 239,240Pu, 238Pu, and 241Am is excessively time-consuming, we only measured a limited set of samples, namely depth-wise mixed samples of the dates 10/98 and 04/99.
For 210Pb we used a paired t-test to the measured unsupported ZioPb inventory (Table 2) knowing the atmospheric deposition rate from gaseous 222Rn escaped to the atmosphere (unsupported 210Pb) to the soil water content (14). To test the validity of this simplified procedure, we compared the measured unsupported 210Pb inventory (Table 2) with a modeled inventory knowing the atmospheric deposition rate of 222Rn (P = 140 Bq m⁻² y⁻¹) (15) for Zurich, located approximately 20 km SE of our site, we can model the 210Pb inventory (I) with the following equation

\[ I(t) = \frac{P}{\lambda} (1 - e^{-\lambda t}) \]  

where λ is the decay constant of 222Rn (0.03108 y⁻¹) and t the time period of deposition and decay. The saturation level of 4500 Bq m⁻², reached after 100 y, compares well with the measured inventory of 4100 ± 200 Bq m⁻² (Table 2).

**Preferential Flow Paths**

An example of water flow heterogeneity is depicted by the dye distribution (Figure 1). The proportion of preferential flow paths, expressed as dye coverage, decreases with depth, being 0.69, 0.38, 0.13, and 0.02 in the four different depth zones from top to bottom.

There is a significantly higher root biomass in the preferential flow paths than in the matrix (p < 0.001, see also Table 1). Roots often show a preference for growing in macroporous interstices rather than in the denser soil matrix or aggregates (16-19).

**Radionuclide Distribution in Relation to Preferential Flow Paths**

137Cs. The 137Cs activity is significantly higher in the preferential flow paths as compared to the matrix (p < 0.001). In 0–9, 9–20, and 20–50 cm depth the 137Cs activity in the preferential flow paths exceeds that of the matrix by factors of 2.2, 2.4, and 3.5, respectively. The differences in the individual depth zones are statistically significant as well (Table 3). From 50–100 cm, the 137Cs activity is close to the detection limit in both matrix and flow path soil with no statistically significant difference between the two flow regions.

The 137Cs activities are tracing the recent flow paths and highlight the importance of preferential flow for the spatial distribution of radionuclides and the temporal stability of the observed flow paths over a period of at least 13 y. Most of the 137Cs originates from the Chernobyl accident on April 26, 1986, and was deposited mainly during a single rainstorm on May 1, 1986 (20). High rainfall intensities are known to promote preferential flow and the transport of rather immobile compounds such as pesticides (7).

210Pb. The distribution of 210Pb between preferential flow paths and matrix is almost the same as in case of 137Cs. The activities of 210Pb are significantly higher in the preferential flow paths than in the matrix (p = 0.001), by a factor of 1.9 in 0–9 cm, 1.3 in 9–20 cm, and 1.3 in 20–50 cm depth (Table 3).

Atmospheric 210Pb is removed from the atmosphere by dry and wet deposition. This represents a steady input into the soil. Despite temporal variations of the 210Pb deposition, on time scales of a year or more, the atmospheric flux remains fairly constant (21, 22). Therefore the 210Pb input was continuous and more or less uniform whereas 137Cs was introduced into the system approximately as a single pulse input. The similarity in their distributions in the soil in relation to the preferential flow paths suggests that the flow paths that were actively conducting water during the time period of the Chernobyl fallout are largely the same ones that were 'active' over the course of years.

238U and 241Am In contrast to 137Cs and 210Pb, the activities of 238U and 241Am seem to be only slightly enriched in the preferential flow paths of the topsoil (0–9 cm). To compare the various radionuclides, we calculated the activity differences between preferential flow paths and matrix samples and normalized them with the inventory given in Table 2. Doing this, the differences between preferential flow paths and the matrix of 238U and 241Am are only slightly smaller than those of 137Cs and 210Pb. In 9–20 cm depth, 238U and 241Am activities are markedly larger in the preferential flow paths. At even greater depths, both
TABLE 3: Activities of Radionuclides and Root Biomass in Stained Flow Paths and Unstained Soil Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Depth (cm)</th>
<th>Root Biomass $^c$</th>
<th>$^{137}$Cs $^d$</th>
<th>$^{240}$Pu $^d$</th>
<th>$^{241}$Am $^d$</th>
<th>Flow Path</th>
<th>Matrix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-9</td>
<td>1804 $^{**}$</td>
<td>82.6 $^{**}$</td>
<td>60 09 $^{**}$</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>0.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-20</td>
<td>859</td>
<td>12.7 $^{**}$</td>
<td>21 22</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-50</td>
<td>645 $^{**}$</td>
<td>4.4 $^{**}$</td>
<td>16 49</td>
<td>0.015</td>
<td>0.004</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-100</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>20.99</td>
<td>&lt;LD</td>
<td>0.006</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Difference between preferential flow paths and matrix is statistically significant ($p < 0.01$ and $p < 0.05$ respectively)
- $^c$ Root biomass activities are decay corrected to March 1, 1998
- $^d$ Measured $^{240}$Pu (supported and unsupported) activities are decay corrected to the date of measurement (February 1999)
- $^e$ Measurement error
- $^{**}$ Not measured
- $^f$ Limit of detection

$^{240}$Pu and $^{241}$Am were only detected in flow-path material. The ratio $^{240}$Pu/$^{241}$Am is remarkably stable in all samples (2.5 ± 0.2), excluding samples with activities close to the detection limit (Table 3). These ratios lie in the same range as those of other samples of Swiss soils obtained in 1999 (Froidevaux, unpublished data). This implies a similar migration rate of Pu and Am.

Plutonium was emitted into the atmosphere as a consequence of atmospheric nuclear bomb tests and the SNAP-9A (Systems for Nuclear Auxiliary Power generator) satellite re-entry in the 1950s and early 1960s (12). It reached the ground both as dry and wet deposition in a variety of rain events, attached to leaf litter, and as particles. The importance of the depositional history for radionuclide migration and distribution in the soil is documented by other studies (13, 23).

The elevated activities of $^{137}$Cs, $^{210}$Po, $^{239,240}$Pu, and $^{241}$Am in preferential flow paths highlight the importance of preferential flow for the mobility of strongly sorbing substances and are an expression of the temporal stability of the preferential flow structures. Generally, all radionuclides investigated in this study are rapidly immobilized by soil particles and show a slow transport behavior in soils and sediments once they are adsorbed (13, 23, 24). Diffusion is probably negligible. For example, Pu occurs in soils and sediments mainly in the form of tightly bound plutonium dioxide (25) and has a high $K_d (>500$ mL g$^{-1}$) (26) and a low diffusion coefficient ($<10^{-10}$ cm$^2$ s$^{-1}$) (27). By comparing nuclear weapon-derived cesium in soils between 1977 and 1982, Smith et al. found no vertical mobility during these 15 years (28).

The occurrence of radionuclides at greater depths implies an initial mobility during the first hours after deposition, when water flow and thus physical rather than chemical processes control their behavior. After the initial displacement, redistribution between phases and surface reactions become more important. We cannot rule out remobilization and translocation of radionuclides by co-transport with dissolved or colloidal ligands (1, 26, 29-31), but even in case of facilitated transport, the main movement of radionuclides would still occur in preferential flow paths. If we assume only an initial mobility of radionuclides immediately after deposition, we can estimate the temporal stability of flow paths to be at least 40 years.

Relevance: Radionuclides travel more rapidly through the supposedly strongly sorbing soil toward groundwater than expected based on the chromatographic transport concept, therefore providing a risk for the groundwater. Recently, activities of $^{137}$Cs above the tolerance level were found in aquifers around Chernobyl (Ukraine) despite a thick soil layer that should have served as a natural filter (Shestopalov and Bohuslavsky, 2000, oral communication).

The second important pathway from the soil to the human food chain is the uptake by plants. The transfer factor relating plant to soil concentrations is obtained from greenhouse experiments using well mixed unstructured soil materials (32). Commonly used transfer factors, e.g., the radionuclide dose estimation program ECOSYS, which is the basis of the emergency management systems in Germany, Austria, and Switzerland and an integral part of the European real-time dose assessment system, assumes homogeneous uptake from a defined soil volume (2). In the original equation

$$C_{\text{plant}} = C_{\text{soil}} F$$

the plant concentration $C_{\text{plant}}$ is expressed in terms of the bulk concentration in the soil and the transfer factor $F$. The bulk concentration $C_{\text{soil}}$ is obtained by mixing the entire radionuclide inventory into the top 10 cm (grassland) or 25 cm (arable land) of the soil. Using the $^{137}$Cs deposition found at our study site and a transfer factor of 0.14 (32) yields a $^{137}$Cs activity in fresh grass of 3.5 Bq kg$^{-1}$ for 25 cm mixing depth or 8.7 Bq kg$^{-1}$ for 10 cm mixing depth. Equation 1 yields highly variable results depending on the mixing depth over which we assume homogeneous distribution of radionuclides (Figure 2, right-hand side).
Knowing the radionuclide and root distribution in the soil, we can estimate the plant concentrations on a more physical and biological basis. Since root biomass is enriched in the preferential flow paths as compared to the soil matrix (Table 3), the elevated radionuclide activities in the preferential flow paths represent higher concentrations in the rhizosphere. The following extended equation illustrates how preferential radionuclide distribution and inhomogeneous rooting can be incorporated into soil-to-plant transfer models

\[
C_{\text{plant}} = \sum_{j} \sum_{i=1}^{n_h} C_i(\Delta z_j) R_j(\Delta z_j) F_j
\]

where \(j = 1\) for preferential flow paths, \(j = 2\) for soil matrix, \(n_h\) refers to the number of soil horizons, \(\Delta z\) to the depths of the individual horizons, \(C_i\) the radionuclide concentration, \(F\) to the transfer factor, and \(R\) to the relative root density expressed as

\[
R_j(\Delta z_j) = \frac{r_j(\Delta z_j) A_j(\Delta z_j)}{\sum_{i=1}^{n_h} \sum_{j=1}^{n_h} r_i(\Delta z_j) A_i}
\]

with \(r_j\) and \(A_j\) being the root density and the area of flow region \(j\). Thus, the root density in the two flow regions (preferential flow paths and matrix) is weighted with the area of the respective flow region to account for the actual root distribution in the soil profile (for the distribution of the root densities between preferential flow paths and matrix within the individual soil horizons, see Figure 2). The radionuclide activity in plants can be calculated on the basis of eq 3 with measured root and radionuclide concentrations in the preferential flow path and matrix compartments, the areas of the two compartments (Table 3, Figure 2), and published transfer factors (in our example, they were assumed to be equal for the two compartments). With measured \(^{137}\text{Cs}\) activities of preferential flow paths and matrix and the respective root concentrations, we can estimate the contribution of the two flow regions to the calculated plant activities. By adding the contributions of both flow regions, we calculate the plant activity to be 6 6 Bq kg\(^{-1}\) (Figure 2, left-hand side). For the calculation, we included the three depth zones from 0 to 0.5 m. However, since the root biomass is relatively small in 20–50 cm depth and \(^{137}\text{Cs}\) activities are low, the contribution of the root uptake from 20 to 50 cm depth to the total plant activity is smaller than 1%.

This example shows that the substantially different elemental concentrations of preferential flow paths and matrix may be a critical factor for calculating plant concentrations with a transfer model. The differentiation of the flow regions is important, because the root distribution, which is a key factor for plant uptake, is biased toward higher root densities in the preferential flow paths. Taking the correlated radionuclide and root distribution between the two flow regions into account provides a more physical and biological basis for the calculation of plant activities than mixing the entire deposition homogeneously over an arbitrarily chosen depth. This concept can also be applied to other elements such as heavy metals or nutrients.

Acknowledgments

We thank J. Leuenberger for his expert technical assistance during fieldwork, J. Beer for unlimited access to the gamma facilities at EAWAG, and F. Hagedorn, A. Johnson, G. Furrer, and A. Papntzt for critically reading the manuscript. We also thank two anonymous reviewers for their careful criticisms and helpful comments. The first author is funded by the Swiss Agency for the Environment, Forests and Landscape (BUWAL), the second author by the Swiss Nuclear Safety Inspectorate (HSK). The third author acknowledges the Federal Office of Public Health for financial support.
Literature Cited


Received for review December 9, 1999 Revised manuscript received July 5, 2000 Accepted July 6, 2000

ES9913636